

# States, the Law and Access to Refugee Protection

Fortresses and Fairness

Edited by  
Maria O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens



• H A R T •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2017

1122863

**Hart Publishing**

An imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Hart Publishing Ltd  
Kemp House  
Chawley Park  
Cumnor Hill  
Oxford OX2 9PH  
UK

Bloomsbury Publishing Plc  
50 Bedford Square  
London  
WC1B 3DP  
UK

**www.hartpub.co.uk**  
**www.bloomsbury.com**

Published in North America (US and Canada) by  
Hart Publishing  
c/o International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213-3786  
USA

**www.isbs.com**

**HART PUBLISHING, the Hart/Stag logo, BLOOMSBURY and the  
Diana logo are trademarks of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc**

First published 2017

© Maria O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens 2017

The Editors have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents  
Act 1988 to be identified as Authors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any  
means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or  
any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission  
in writing from the publishers.

While every care has been taken to ensure the accuracy of this work, no responsibility for loss or damage  
occasioned to any person acting or refraining from action as a result of any statement in it can be  
accepted by the authors, editors or publishers.

All UK Government legislation and other public sector information used in the work is Crown  
Copyright ©. All House of Lords and House of Commons information used in the work is Parliamentary  
Copyright ©. This information is reused under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0  
(<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3>)  
except where otherwise stated.

All Eur-lex material used in the work is © European Union,  
<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/>, 1998–2017.

**British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN:	HB:	978-1-50990-128-9
	ePDF:	978-1-50990-129-6
	ePub:	978-1-50990-130-2

**A catalogue record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.**

Series: Studies in International Law, volume 65

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon  
Printed and bound in Great Britain by Lightning Source UK Ltd

To find out more about our authors and books visit [www.hartpublishing.co.uk](http://www.hartpublishing.co.uk). Here you will find  
extracts, author information, details of forthcoming events and the option to sign up for our newsletters.

# Contents

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>List of Editors and Contributors</i> .....	xiii
<i>Abbreviations</i> .....	xix

## Part I: Conceptual Background

<b>1. Access to Refugee Protection: Key Concepts and Contemporary Challenges</b> .....	3
<i>Maria O'Sullivan and Dallal Stevens</i>	
I. Introduction .....	3
II. Background: 'Asylum' and 'Refugee Protection' .....	5
A. Meaning of Asylum .....	7
B. Right to Seek Asylum .....	8
C. 'Refugee Protection' .....	9
III. States, Access to Territory and the Law .....	10
A. 'The State' (or States) and 'Borders' .....	10
(i) Territory, Borders and the Law .....	10
(ii) State 'Responsibility' .....	16
IV. 'Asylum Justice' and Contemporary Due Process Challenges .....	20
A. The Concept of Access to Justice .....	20
(i) State Interpretation and Implementation of Due Process .....	22
(ii) Fair Hearing/Procedural Fairness .....	24
(iii) Legal Assistance .....	25
(iv) Fast Track/Accelerated Procedures .....	26
(v) Vulnerable Applicants .....	27
V. Conclusion .....	27
<b>2. Asylum in the Context of Immigration Control: Exclusion by Default or Design?</b> .....	29
<i>Nadine El-Enany</i>	
I. Introduction .....	29
II. The Limits of the Refugee Convention .....	30
III. The Impact of 'Fortress Europe' on Protection .....	34
IV. The Migrant and the Refugee: A Costly Distinction .....	36
V. Alan Kurdi: The Human Refugee .....	41
VI. Conclusion: Racism, Exclusion and Blaming the Victim .....	44

**Part II: Access to Territory**

<b>3. Where Do State Responsibilities Begin and End? Border Exclusions and State Responsibility .....</b>	<b>47</b>
<i>Júlia Iván</i>	
I. Introduction .....	47
II. The Application of Human Rights Law to Borders .....	49
III. The Border Monitoring Experience in Hungary 2007–13: Difficulties in Accessing Protection .....	53
IV. The Change of Practice in 2013–14: Towards a More Comprehensive Border Control Practice .....	57
V. Building a Physical and Legal Fence: Closure of Hungary's Southern Borders .....	60
VI. Litigation and Follow-up of the Cases of Removed Refugees and Migrants .....	64
VII. Conclusions.....	66
<b>4. Access to International Protection: Border Issues in Turkey.....</b>	<b>69</b>
<i>Cavidan Soykan</i>	
I. Background and Context .....	69
II. The Current Situation and the New Law .....	71
III. Access to Physical Territory: Problems at the Turkish Borders .....	75
A. Forced Returns and Illegal Removals: Getting into Turkey from Iran.....	76
B. Transiting Turkey: Push Backs and Detention.....	78
IV. Barriers to Accessing Asylum Justice: The Role of the UNHCR in Turkey .....	81
V. UNHCR'S Limited Access to Removal Centres.....	84
VI. Conclusion .....	88
<b>5. Interdiction and Screening of Asylum Seekers at Sea: Implications for Asylum Justice .....</b>	<b>93</b>
<i>Maria O'Sullivan</i>	
I. Introduction .....	93
II. Relevant Legal Principles.....	95
A. International Standards .....	95
B. Regional Standards.....	97
C. Domestic Procedural Fairness Principles.....	98
III. Screening at Sea and Fairness—State Practice .....	100
A. Introduction.....	100
B. Australian Interdiction and Screening at Sea .....	102
C. The High Court Decision in CPCF.....	103
D. Legislative Changes: 2014.....	108

IV.	Analysis .....	109
V.	Conclusion .....	111
<b>6.</b>	<b>Detained at the Border: Obstacles to Entry for Central American Refugees in the United States.....</b>	<b>113</b>
	<i>Maggie Morgan and Deborah Anker</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	113
II.	Overview of Central American Refugee Migration to the United States .....	117
III.	Primary Causes of Flight from Central America .....	119
A.	'Third-generation' Gang Violence .....	119
B.	Gender-based Violence .....	123
IV.	Crossing the Border: Obstacles to Entry for Central American Refugees .....	124
A.	Dangers in Crossing .....	125
B.	Border Militarisation .....	126
C.	Expedited Removal/Credible Fear Screenings .....	129
D.	Detention.....	132
V.	Conclusion .....	133
	<b>Part III: Access to Justice and a Refugee Status Determination Procedure</b>	
<b>7.</b>	<b>Accessing Fair and Efficient Asylum Procedures in the EU: Legal Safeguards and Loopholes in the Common European Asylum System .....</b>	<b>137</b>
	<i>Kris Pollet</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	137
II.	Access to Protection at the EU External Borders: Safeguards and Gaps in the EU Legal Framework .....	140
III.	Access to the Asylum Procedure and Ensuring Quality of Decision-making .....	145
A.	Access to Information on How and Where to Apply for International Protection .....	147
B.	Registration of Applications for International Protection .....	148
C.	Access to a Quality Personal Interview and Country of Origin Information .....	152
IV.	Access to a Fair and Efficient Asylum Procedure in Practice in Selected EU Member States .....	158
A.	Registration of Asylum Applications.....	158
B.	Conducting, Recording and Reporting of Personal Interviews .....	165
V.	Conclusion .....	166

x *Contents*

<b>8. The State of the Asylum System in South Africa</b> .....	167
<i>Corey Johnson and Sergio Carciotto</i>	
I. Introduction .....	167
II. Legal Framework: 1998–2014 .....	170
A. The Refugees Act 1998 .....	170
B. The Immigration Act 2002 .....	172
III. Restricting Access: Policies and Practice .....	173
A. Pre-screening Procedures at the RRO .....	173
B. ‘Quota’ Systems and Limits on the Number of Applications Lodged .....	175
C. First and Third ‘Safe’ Country Concepts .....	176
D. Safe Country of Origin Principle .....	178
E. Asylum Transit Visa Requirements at RROs .....	179
IV. Policy Shift: The ‘New Paradigm’ .....	180
A. Security and the ‘New Paradigm’ .....	181
B. Urban RRO Closures and Relocation .....	183
C. Legislative Amendments .....	187
V. Conclusion .....	189
<b>9. Access to Asylum and Reception Conditions in Western Balkans: Focus on Bosnia and Herzegovina and Croatia</b> .....	191
<i>Selma Porobić and Drago Župarić-Iljić</i>	
I. Introduction .....	191
II. Development of Asylum Systems and the Role of External Conditioning .....	194
A. Bosnia and Herzegovina .....	194
B. Croatia .....	196
III. Access to Asylum and Refugee Status Determination .....	199
A. Bosnia and Herzegovina .....	200
B. Croatia .....	204
IV. Enabling Protection: Refugees’ Recognition Rates .....	207
A. Bosnia and Herzegovina .....	207
B. Croatia .....	209
V. Reception Conditions in Bosnia and Herzegovina and Croatia .....	212
A. Bosnia and Herzegovina .....	212
B. Croatia .....	215
VI. Discussion and Conclusion .....	218
<b>10. Access to Justice for Syrian Refugees in Lebanon</b> .....	223
<i>Dallal Stevens</i>	
I. Introduction .....	223
II. Legal Background .....	224
III. Refugee Presence, Policy and Access to Process .....	227

A.	Palestinians .....	228
B.	Non-Palestinians .....	230
IV.	Conditions and Consequences .....	236
A.	Deteriorating Conditions .....	236
B.	<i>Refoulement</i> and Rejection .....	238
V.	Conclusion .....	241
<b>11.</b>	<b>Accelerated Asylum Procedures in the United Kingdom and Australia: 'Fast Track' to <i>Refoulement</i>?</b> .....	<b>243</b>
	<i>Linda Kirk</i>	
I.	Introduction .....	243
II.	United Kingdom .....	245
A.	Introduction and Development of the DFT .....	245
B.	Selection of Applicants for the DFT .....	248
(i)	Screening Interview .....	248
(ii)	'Quick Decision' .....	250
(iii)	Flexibility Guidelines .....	251
(iv)	Detained Non-suspensive Appeal (DNSA) .....	252
(v)	DFT Time Frames and Access to Legal Representation .....	253
(vi)	Decision Outcomes in the DFT .....	254
C.	Appeal Process .....	254
III.	Australia .....	258
A.	Background to the 'Fast Track' Procedures .....	258
B.	Brief Overview of Australia's Protection Status Determination System .....	259
(i)	Primary Decision .....	259
(ii)	Review by the Administrative Appeals Tribunal .....	260
(iii)	Judicial Review .....	261
C.	The 'Fast Track' Procedure for 'Asylum Legacy Caseload' Applicants .....	261
(i)	Selection for Inclusion in the FTP .....	262
(ii)	Access to Legal Assistance .....	263
D.	The Stages of the FTP .....	263
(i)	Primary Decision .....	263
(ii)	'Excluded Fast Track Review Applicants' .....	263
(iii)	Review by the Immigration Assessment Authority for Non-excluded Fast Track Procedure Applicants .....	265
(iv)	The Powers of the Immigration Assessment Authority (IAA) .....	266

xii *Contents*

(v) Time Frames for Decision-making .....	269
(vi) Challenges to IAA Decisions .....	269
IV. Conclusion .....	269
<b>12. Access to Asylum for Victims of Trafficking under a Human Rights-based Approach .....</b>	<b>271</b>
<i>Nula Frei and Constantin Hruschka</i>	
I. Introduction .....	271
II. The Human Rights Framework for Victims of Human Trafficking .....	274
A. Protection from Further Harm .....	276
B. Identification .....	276
C. Residence Permit .....	277
D. Assistance .....	278
E. Repatriation and Prohibition of <i>Refoulement</i> .....	279
III. Identification of Victims of Trafficking in Asylum Procedures .....	280
A. The Identification Process in Asylum Procedures .....	281
B. The Status Quo: Self-identification, Credibility and Biases .....	282
IV. Access to the Asylum Procedure .....	284
A. Access to the Asylum Procedure in Europe: The Dublin Regulation .....	285
B. Challenges for Victims of Trafficking Under the Dublin System .....	287
C. Reconciling the Frameworks .....	289
V. Access to International Protection .....	291
A. Refugee Law .....	291
B. Complementary Protection .....	294
VI. Solutions .....	295
<b>13. States, the Law and Access to Refugee Protection: Concluding Reflections .....</b>	<b>297</b>
<i>Dallal Stevens and Maria O'Sullivan</i>	
I. Introduction .....	297
II. Access to Territory .....	298
III. Access to Asylum Procedures .....	301
IV. Conclusion .....	303
<i>Index</i> .....	305